

1st Tshogde Minutes

2nd Thromde Council

2/26/2016

THIMPHU THROMDE

Table of Contents

Venue :	2
Date & Time:	2
Members present	2
Invitees	2
Opening Remarks by Chairperson	2
Agenda 1. Budget proposal for 2015-2016 Fiscal Year	3
Agenda 2. Muster roll remuneration	5
Agenda 3. Tshogde Minutes to be circulated both in English and Dzongkha	6
Agenda 4. The public to be informed through media during the time of meetings	7
Agenda 5. Doctor Toilet project	7
Agenda 6. Online education system	8
Agenda 7. Temple near clock tower to be handed over to Zhung Dratshang	8
Agenda 8. Some of the Muster roll worker to be transferred to Environment Division	9
Agenda 9. Chorten renovations in Jungzhina and re-construction in Babesa	9
Agenda 10. Salaries for Council Members	9

1ST THROMDE TSHOGDE

Venue : DYT Hall, Thimphu Dzongkhag on 1st day and Thrompon Chamber on 2nd day

Date & Time: 26th and 29th February 2016, 3:00PM - 6:00PM

Members present

Sl/No	Name	Designation
1	Dasho Kinlay Dorjee	Thrompon, Chairperson
2	Mr. Pasang Doji	Executive Secretary, Member Secretary
3	Mr. Namgay Tshering	Babesa Tshogpa, Member
4	Mrs. Phub Dem	Olakha Tshogpa, Member
5	Mr. Kinga Yonten	Norzin Tshogpa, Member
6	Mr. Rinzin Dorji	Changangkha Tshogpa, Member
7	Mrs. Dorji Dema	Motithang Tshogpa, Member
8	Mr. Ugyen Penjor	Jungzhina Tshogpa, Member
9	Mr. Ugyen	Taba/Dechencholing Tshogpa, Member

Invitees

Sl/No	Name	Designation/Division/Section
1	Mr. Hastabahadur Sangpang	Chief ADM Officer, AFD
2	Mr. Sonam Nima	Deputy Chief Accounts Officer, AFD
4	Mr. Nakphel	Head, Water Section, Infrastructure Division
5	Mr. Yeshey Wangdi	Executive Engineer, Environment Division
6	Mr. Jigme Loday	Architect, Development Control Division
7	Mr. Sonam Dhendup	Census Officer, Census Section
9	Mr. Dorji Rabten	HRO, HR Section
10	Mr. Dorji Phurba	Head, Customer Service Centre
11	Mrs. Jigme Choden	LRO, SLMS
12	Mr. Khandu	Legal Section
13	Mr. Sangay Dakpa	Building Inspector, DCD
14	Mr. Karma Dorji	Planning Officer, Policy and Planning Section
15	Media Personnel	Kuensel Corporation

The first sitting of 2nd Council of Thimphu Thromde was held on 26th February 2016 within a month after the election as per the LG Act of Bhutan. It began with traditional Marchhang and Zhugdrel ceremonies as enshrined in the LG Act. The main agenda tabled was the budget 2016-2017.

Opening Remarks by Chairperson

Right after the traditional ceremonies, the chairperson opened the session with few opening remarks. He congratulated all the council members for having elected as the people's representative in the recent local government election. He also welcomed all the members and

invitees to the first session of the Thromde Tshogde. In supplement to the Chairperson, the member secretary also congratulated the council members for their successful election results. He also apologized the council for having conducted the session in an ad-hoc manner due to some unavoidable circumstances. He also informed the council that starting next Tshogde, all Tshogpas will be informed to inform the people and get the issues to be tabled in the council. If public are interested to participate in the Tshogde, may be the matter can be looked at depending on the necessity. All relevant Thromde officials and other relevant officials from relevant agencies will be informed and invited to attend the Tshogde.

The Tshogde unanimously decided to refrain Thromde Thuemi from attending the session nor to table his agenda as there are no proper roles and responsibilities enshrined in LG Act. Unless Thromde do not receive any directives from higher authorities, Thuemi will not be allowed to attend the future Tshogdes as well. According to Legal section, roles and responsibilities of Thromde Thuemi are not clear in LG Act and would be better to consult either the Election Commission or Department of Local Governance for that matter. Tshogde decided to wait for the proper directives from higher authorities and meanwhile Thuemi in collaboration with other Thromde thuemis of Phuntsholing and Gelephu can sought clarifications from relevant agencies and authorities.

Agenda 1. Budget proposal for 2015-2016 Fiscal Year

The Accounts section presented to the Tshogde the budget proposal for the FY 2016-2017. The budget was proposed by each Division and Section based on the budget notification of MoF. Before the budget presentation, the Accounts section presented the past and current expenditure statements as an information and the basis for the 2016-2017 proposal.

Previous years budget status :						
Fiscal Years :	Revenue	Remarks	Current Expdt.	Remarks	Govt. Subsidy	Difference
2009-2010	72.900		84.570		30.100	18.430
2010-2011	78.350		108.530		30.000	-0.180
2011-2012	110.000		153.960		69.449	25.489
2012-2013	91.120		159.690		20.000	-48.570
2013-2014	84.750		141.390		41.531	-15.109
2014-2015	86.670		155.408		48.543	-20.195
2015-2016	58.818	till Dec, 2015	84.171	till Jan, 2016	35.083	9.730
2016-2017	94.712	projection	130.468	Projection	31.575	-4.181

The revenue for the FY 2015-2016 till December 2015 was 58.82M and the current expenditure was Nu. 84.17M till January 2016. The government subsidy was Nu 35.083M. For the FY 2016-2017, the revenue projection is Nu. 94.712M and the total budget proposal for current expenditure 2016-2017 is Nu. 130.468M. The government has agreed for a subsidy of Nu. 31.575M which is a difference of 4.181M. The Chairperson informed that the if the revenue generation is more than the projection, the difference of 4.181M could be covered.

Sl/No	Budget particular	Budget Ceiling	Proposed Budget	Difference
1	Current Budget	31.575M Subsidy	130.468M	4.181 M
2	Capital Budget	150.00 M Subsidy (Ceiling)	151.03M	1.03M

The budget ceiling for the FY 2016-2017 is Nu. 150.00M for capital expenditure and a current subsidy of is Nu. 31.575M. A difference of Nu 4.181M in case of current expenditure is after the inclusion of Nu 94.712M revenue projection ($94.712+31.575= 126.287$ and $130.468-126.287= 4.181$). A difference of Nu. 1.03 in case of capital budget will be discussed during the Budget discussion with MoF.

Discussion

The members discussed on the inclusion of Rural Life Insurance in the current budget, a sum of Nu/ 0.4M. This provision was kept mainly to pay a sum of Nu. 15,000 to the people at the time of death. According to some of the members, this has to be paid by the Insurance company because the amount is being received by Thromde and deposited to the insurance company. The Tshogde recommended the accounts section to cross check whether the amount is being deposited with the insurance company or retained with Thromde. In the second day of Tshogde, it was cleared by the accounts section that the amount is being deposited with the insurance company (RICB) and there is no need for Thromde to pay to the people but facilitate the payment with RIBC. In this case, a provision of Nu. 0.4M to be removed from the current budget proposal. The Tshogde members also recommended the Thromde management to look into the possibilities of auctioning the old and off road vehicles that are with Thromde which would help reduce the current expenditure and help increase the revenue. The Tshogde also recommended the environment division, if public toilets could also be constructed in recreational areas like in Sangaygang and also maintenance of the existing public toilets have to be carried out.

Also during the discussion of current budget of Engineering Division, the members requested for the metering of water in areas where there is none in order to cover the water related current expenditure. The chairperson informed that the metering will be carried out. The members also recommended the engineering division to study the water source available in Motithang, which can serve as the alternative to the current system in the area. For this the water section agreed to carry out the survey to study the sustainability of the source.

The Tshogde also informed that each Tshogpas should within two months (By April 2016) submit the proposal for the development of infrastructure in their respective constituency and submit to the management to be included in the budget 2016-2017. Once the proposal is readied, the tender documents and estimates of the all the works will be prepared before the budget is approved in July 2016. The tendering works will be convened as soon as the budget has been approved.

Decision

Tshogde endorsed the budget proposal 2016-2017 with following recommendations. Tshogde decided to exclude rural life insurance from the budget as it has to be paid by RICB but Thromde to facilitate the payment. Also decided that each Tshogpa should submit the proposals if any within two months and if no proposal comes, Thromde management will decide where to allocate the fund. Tshogde also recommended that the tender documents and estimates to be readied by the concerned Division/Section before the budget has been approved.

Action: Accounts Section and Concerned Division/Section

Agenda 2. Muster roll remuneration

The HR Section has submitted the list of muster roll workers who have been relieved from their normal duty after having crossed the maximum limit age as decided by previous Tshogde. Some of them have served for 4 years and some have served even more than 20 years in Thromde. The Chief ADM presented a list of muster roll and their benefits if it has to be paid:

List of Muster Roll staff relieved w.e.f 1st January 2016 on reaching 65 years

Sl. No	Name	CID #	Date of birth	Appt Date	No. of Completed years	Daily wage	Monthly wage	6 months salary	Gratuity payable	Remarks
1	Dorji Dukpa	11807000918	1.1.1948	1.2.1990	25	324.00	9,720.00	58,320.00	243,000.00	
2	Ran Bdr Gurung	11302001785	1.1.1940	1.7.1987	28	234.00	7,020.00	42,120.00	196,560.00	
3	Harka Maya Gurung	11216001383	1.1.1945	1.1.1993	22	215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	141,900.00	
4	Jas Bdr Ghalley	11209001508	1.1.1949	1.7.1994	21	234.00	7,020.00	42,120.00	147,420.00	
5	Nar Bdr Gurung	11216001338		1.7.1994	21	234.00	7,020.00	42,120.00	147,420.00	
6	Phurba	11901000823	1.1.1948	1.2.1994	21	234.00	7,020.00	42,120.00	147,420.00	
7	Tshering Phuntsho	11006000895	1.1.1948		4	324.00	9,720.00	58,320.00	-	
8	Dhendup	10716001407	1.1.1947	1.2.2011	4	234.00	7,020.00	42,120.00	-	
9	Ganga Maya Labar	10309002549	1.1.1949	1.1.1987	4	215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	-	Transferred from PWD in 2011
10	Rupa Maya Gurung	11109000063	1.1.1949	23.6.2001	4	215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	-	Transferred from PWD in 2011
11	Dhan Bdr Pradhan	11309002604	1.1.1949	1.1.2004	12	215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	77,400.00	
12	Yam Bdr Pakharing	10308001253	1.1.1950	1.1.1995	20	215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	129,000.00	
13	Nasila	10608001534	1948			215.00	6,450.00	38,700.00	-	
	Total						93,240.00	559,440.00	1,230,120.00	

The Chief ADM Officer informed that they have requested for the payment of 6 months' salary since they don't get any other benefits.

Discussion

All members felt the need to give them such benefits as they have been working for so long. Some members cautioned that it would be better if it can be carried out based on the rules and regulations. The Accounts Section informed that as per BCSR no civil servants would be entitled for any benefits if he/she has not served for at least 10 years or more. Some members also pointed out that since they have officially requested for half year salary, request could be considered. The Tshogde could not come to a decision and decided to table the next day. On the second day, Tshogde decided to pay them the 6 months salary.

Decision

Tshogde decided, they will be paid 6 months salary for having served Thromde. Henceforth, 6 months salary will be paid only to those who have joined in 2011 or earlier. Those joining after 2011, a 6 months salary will be paid only if he/she serves 10 or more years. Those workers who goes out without informing the management will not be entitled for such benefits. The Tshogde also recommended Human Resource Section to maintain the personal file for each worker.

Action: DCFO and HR Section

Agenda 3. Tshogde Minutes to be circulated both in English and Dzongkha

The Tshogpas requested the Tshogde minutes to be circulated both in English and Dzongkha. This is for the benefit of those English illiterate.

Discussion

It has been practiced at the beginning of the first council but could not be continued due to high cost implications to Thromde for translation. In view of this, the earlier Tshogde also started a English class session for those Tshogpas who are English illiterate to at least familiarize with the English terms. Some members felt that continuing the English classes for Tshogpas will not only help in understanding the points reflected in Minutes but can also help develop some of the basic skills in English that can be of help on day to day lives of Tshogpas.

Decision

The Tshogde decided that the English classes for Tshogpas will be continued and the translation of Minutes hereafter will have to be done by Mrs. Tshering Pem who is a Dzongkha Coordinator in Thimphu Thromde once she joins the office after the completion of her EoL.

Action: HR Section

Agenda 4. The public to be informed through media during the time of meetings

The Tshogpas requested that during the time of meetings, people have to be informed through media beforehand according to the Act. This is mainly to increase the attendance during the important public meetings.

Decision

Tshogde decided that all Tshogpas will have to fix a date and the announcement for public meetings for all constituencies will have to be made together. A public meeting to be conducted right after budget discussion, once every year.

Action: Tshogpas and AFD

Agenda 5. Doctor Toilet project

The Environment Division presented Tshogde the background of "Doctor toilet project". The Techno park and MoLHR have given the entrepreneur training for those unemployed and even collected some of the business proposals from the youths. The proposal "Doctor Toilet" came up first and was given recognition by MoLHR and Techno park. Their main roles are to renovate, clean and maintain the existing public toilets within Thromde. They will also provide basic necessities like soaps and toilet papers. They have even submitted that after the renovations, the fees will be increased to Nu. 7.

Discussion

Some of the members said that existing fees of Nu. 5 is payable and with the increasing of fee to Nu. 7, the people would be compelled to defecate in open spaces because the more people using the public toilets are those old ones and low income groups. The Chairperson also informed that the talks with RENEW is going on to handover the public toilet near Milk booth in Chubachhu, where the RENEW is going to establish a centre for selling second hand goods to generate some revenue for them. They will also maintain the toilet. Many members supported the Doctor toilet project as it creates employment for the youths at first and secondly the toilets within the Thromde will be maintained well.

Decision

Tshogde decided to handover 5 public toilets, Near RICB, City Bus parking, JB Market, Lungtenzampa Bus terminal and Clock Tower. The major renovations will be carried out by Thromde and the fees to be maintained at Nu 5. The water and electric bills have to be cleared by project themselves. The contract will be for one year at first and it can be extended depending on their performances. The environment division should come up with proper terms and conditions. The public toilet near Milk Booth will be handed over to RENEW.

Action: Environment Division

Agenda 6. Online education system

The Chairperson has informed the new online system initiated in Thromde Education system whereby the parents and students can register their students online. The system was developed by a group of expertise from Malaysia and has been found successful. He also informed that the group of 2 or 3 will be again visiting Bhutan to further enhance the system and integrate some of the new features where each students and Teachers will be provided with user IDs and they can avail online resources. The system can also help the students, parents, School management and the TEO office to communicate online. Later when the system has become fully functional, each student will be charged Nu. 500 per year. The main thing that requires Tshogde's approval is the total amount required for the hospitality of these expertise who will be visiting Bhutan soon. The total amount hotel charges including fooding and travel expenses within Bhutan and training cost while in Bhutan.

Discussion

The members supported the new education system and that has helped many not having to wait in line for long. The members also requested for those parents and students who are computer illiterate, Thromde should render support for online registration.

Decision

Tshogde approved the expenses for the groups from Malaysia who will be visiting Bhutan soon to enhance the online education system. The expenses include hotel charges with food and travel expenses while in Bhutan including the cost of training if any for the users. Tshogde also decided that CSC will provide services to those who are computer illiterate and who do not have access to internet system.

Action: DCFO, Thromde Education and CSC

Agenda 7. Temple near clock tower to be handed over to Zhung Dratshang

The current situation in the temple where the caretaker living in the temple with family posses risks to the temple and moreover the visitors will not be able to visit the temple if required. Therefore, it would be better to hand it over to Zhung Drathsang who will look after the temple and will also appoint one tsipa lopen (Astrologer) to render religious services to the people.

Decision

The temple will be handed over to Zhung Dratshang and a tsipa Lopen will have to be appointed to render public services. He should make offerings in the morning and evening. The Norzin thuemi should take an active role in handing taking and it will have to be broadcast through media.

Action: Norzin Thuemi

Agenda 8. Some of the Muster roll worker to be transferred to Environment Division

There are over 300 muster roll workers with Thromde and majority of them are under road section in Engineering Division. Although the workers have been clearing/cleaning the wastes/littering along the drains including sweeping of roads and roadside drains, it was felt that transferring of the workers to Environment Division would help optimize the activities further since the storm water drains are being cleared by Environment Division. This will also help in cleaning the litters in vacant state land and on either side of the road shoulder.

Decision

Tshogde decided that the adequate number of workers required to do the road maintenance works to be retained and rest to be transferred to Environment Division. The Environment and Engineering Divisions will have to work on this by March 2016 and by April 2016 the workers will have to be transferred.

Action: Engineering & Environment Divisions

Agenda 9. Chorten renovations in Jungzhina and re-construction in Babesa

The community has requested Thromde for the approval of Chorten Dangrim renovation works in Jungzhina. They said that they have the budget of Nu. 0.2M which lapsed during last fiscal year. So they want to renovate the roof tops with cement for the benefit of all sentient beings. According to the Chairperson, the constituency grants have been already used to renovated Chortens within Thromde and there is no budget balance. For this renovations, Tshogde will have to approved the budget along with the budget for the Chorten reconstruction works at Babesa which has been already discussed in earlier Tshogde.

Decision

The Tshogde decided that budget for Chorten renovations in Jungzhina and re-construction in Babesa will be utilized from the current or capital savings from the current Fiscal Year. The renovation of the Chorten Dangrim in Jungzhina can be stated however, for re-construction of the Babesa Chorten should be approved by the Department of Culture, MoHCA.

Action: Jungzhina and Babesa Thuemis and DCFO for budget savings

Agenda 10. Salaries for Council Members

This was put up by AFD to clear on the effective date for the preparation of salaries for the council members.

Decision

The Tshogde decided that the council members have joined the duties on 12th February and accordingly the salaries and other benefits will be effected from the date of joining. The salary for Thromde thuemi will be prepared once Thromde receives clear directives from competent authority.

Action: Accounts Section

Minute keeper: Karma Dorji, Planning Officer

The End