

11TH THROMDE TSHOGDE MINUTES (2nd Council)

THIMPHU THROMDE



11thThromde Tshogde – 2nd Council

Venue: Mandala Resort, Paro Dzongkhag

Date: 14 June 2018

Time: 10:30 – 19:30

Members present

| | | | |
|---|---------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------------------|
| 1 | Dasho Kinlay Dorjee | Thrompon | Chairperson |
| 2 | Mr. Kinley Penjore | Offtg.Executive Secretary | Member Secretary |
| 3 | Mr. Namgay Tshering | Member | Deputy Chairperson/Babesa <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 4 | Mrs. Dorji Dema | Member | Motithang <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 5 | Mrs. Phub Dem | Member | Olakha <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 6 | Mr. Kuenga Yonten | Member | Norzin <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 7 | Mr. Rinzin Dorji | Member | Changangkha <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 8 | Mr. Ugyen Penjore | Member | Jungzhina <i>Tshogpa</i> |
| 9 | Mr. Ugyen | Member | Taba-Dechencholing <i>Tshogpa</i> |

Invitees

| | | |
|---|-------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| 1 | Mr. Thinley Norbu | Chief Urban Planner, UPD |
| 2 | Mr. Sonam Dorjee | CAO, AFD |
| 3 | Mr. Yeshe Wangdi | Head, Environment Division |
| 4 | Mr. Ugyen Dorji | Urban Planner, UPD |
| 5 | Mr. Ugyen Tshechu Dorji | Legal Officer, Legal Section |
| 6 | Mr. Karma Jamtsho | Chief Engineer, Infrastructure Division |
| 7 | Mr. Palden Khandu | Chief, DRD |
| 8 | Mrs. Kuenzang | Head, SLMS |

| | | |
|----|------------------------|------------------------------------------|
| 9 | Mr. Sonam Rinzin | Procurement Officer, Procurement Section |
| 10 | Mr. Sonam Tshering | ATEO, Thromde Education |
| 11 | Mr. Oma Pati Luitel | Sr. ICT. Officer, IT Section |
| 12 | Mr. Kuenzang Gyeltshen | Head, Electrical Section |
| 13 | Ms. Kuenley Yangdon | Dy. EE, ID (rapporteur) |
| 14 | Ms. Ugyen Lhamo | AE, ID (rapporteur) |

Welcome and Opening Remarks

1. The Chairperson welcomed all the council members and Thromde Officials and other invitees to the 11th Thromde Tshogde. It was held at Mandala Resort in Paro Dzongkhag.
2. He expressed his satisfaction with the achievements made in Thimphu Thromde in last seven years. He also shared the Royal Command for the achievements recognised so far:

The first was over the 6KM long footpath with common duct constructed along the Expressway from Ngabirongchu till Lungtenzampa which has immense benefit to the general public.

The second was for the World Bank funded project to bring the drinking water from Tango, Dodeyna to Thimphu Thromde. His Majesty had expressed that this waster project will resolve the water shortages within Thimphu City. In this regard, the Chair mentioned that the Infrastructure Division and World Bank project team should work together towards fulfilling the expectation of His Majesty the King.

The third is over the beautification works carried out by Environment Division along Doebum Lam. This is a successful new idea to bring in private party to plant flowers, water then and take care for a duration of one year. Similar beautification works are planned along express way, Norzin Lam and Changlam during the next financial year.

3. The Chair expressed gratitude on behalf of all the council members for good works carried out by all the Divisions, which has earned such recognition from His Majesty.

4. The Chair also expressed his heartfelt gratitude and thanked Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen on behalf of the Tshogde for gracing the inauguration of the waste segregation plant at Ngabirongchu, Babesa. It is the first project of its kind in the country amongst many initiatives in minimising the quantity of waste going to Meme lakha landfill. This project is through the private investment of Greener Way supported by Thromde in providing land lease and other logistics. The segregated waste from this plant will be used by Green Road and Jemina Paper recycling plant supported through YDF.
5. The Chair expressed great concern over the challenges that Thromde faces today, the deterioration of social behaviour of our youths due to use of alcohol and substance abuses. Thromde in collaboration with agencies like BICMA, BNCA, Ministry of Economic Affairs, NCWC, Care Bhutan and RBP is conducting regular night petrol on weekends mainly to check compliance to the laws, rules and regulations in place for bars and entertainment centres.

The Chair also shared information on two building owners from Olakha that houses entertainment centres and found not following the closing time on most occasions. The landlords were given final warning to ensure such business operators follow the rules or else Thromde will revoke their occupancy certificates. They were explained that Thromde will disconnect utilities after six months of not having their building certificates.

- 5.1. Similarly Thromde will handle the other building owners where bars are seen operating beyond the allowable timing.
- 5.2. As discussed in the previous meetings, it was again agreed that location clearance for bars, discotheque, karokes and/or Drayangs will be issued only within the urban core area, i.e. the Norzin Lam and Chang Lam as defined in the new BICMA rules and regulations.

Agenda 11.1. Adoption of Agendas

After reviewing the agendas for discussion, the proposed agendas were approved.

Agenda 11.2. Follow up on 10th Thromde Tshogde Minutes

Due to non-availability of the 10th Thromde Tshogde Minutes, the follow up discussion could not be held. However it needs to be presented in the next Tshogde.

Decision

To be presented in the next Tshogde by Mr Dorji Phurba, Administrative Officer.

Action: Administrative Officer, ADM Section

Agenda 11.3. Endorsement for Utilization of savings from the Thromde Capital Budgets

Chief Administration Officer presented the detail budget balance from FY 2017-18 and also the discussion held in the 13th Management meeting with regard to transferring the balance budget under Environment Division to Infrastructure Division.

| Total Revised Budget Vs. Total Expenditure Vs. Budget Balance as on 11th June, 2018 | | | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| SL. No | Divisions | Total Allocation | Total Expenditure | Budget Balance |
| 1 | Direction & Management Services | 155.637 | 130.995 | 24.642 |
| 2 | Environment Division | 58.884 | 34.693 | 24.191 |
| 3 | Infrastructure Division | 627.808 | 468.445 | 159.363 |
| 4 | UPD,DCD & Land | 346.971 | 302.043 | 44.928 |
| | | 1,189.300 | 936.175 | 253.125 |
| | Education | 90.130 | 60.460 | 29.670 |

The Chair explained on the different budget activity heads falling under Direction & Management Services and highlighted on the savings compared to the previous years such as expenses on other personal emoluments has decreased from previous year of about Nu 31.00M to Nu 29.00M which further came down to Nu 25.00M during 2017-18. This reduction came due to the compulsory retirement of muster roll staffs after crossing 65 of age. However this has led to increase in vehicle expenditure due to more usage of vehicles and the other machineries such as road sweeping machines.

There is a need for Thromde to become less labor oriented and concentrate more on outsourcing the works and also increase the usage of machineries to increase the efficiency of the agency in delivering services.

Change in the allocation of Budget from the Direction and Management Services to Individual Divisions was proposed from next Financial Year. These shall include activities like payment of salaries, utility bills, and procurement of office stationeries, vehicle repair works and fuel disbursement amongst others. Through this change, the operating cost of each division will be known and thereon it will assist in controlling the expenditures thereafter.

Against the enquiry raised by some of the members on requirement of budget for environmental related works in Demkhong, the Chair gave the following explanations:

The transferred budget will be used as additional budget for connecting the sewerage

network from Motithang/Changangkha to the new Sewerage Treatment Plant near RSTA/YHSS area. This budget will be utilized from the balance SDP IV budget for Landfill development under Environment Division. Due to limited time in utilizing the balance budget in new works, it is not possible to tender out for new work for the Demkhongs. The budget will be used for funding the ongoing works which are already under implementation and are in need of additional fund.

Motithang Tshogpa expressed her concern over the incomplete sewer development works at Motithang areas and requested for clarification on whether the balance work will be carried out within this additional budget.

The Chair again explained in detail that due to incompleteness of the trunk line across Wangchu River opposite Tarayana Office, sewer line for Chubachu to the treatment plant is still not connected. The Motithang residents are not yet connected to the sewer system and sewer leakages are still a problem. Only after all the internal links are complete, the connection to sewer treatment plant will be done. It is expected that Sewerage Treatment Plant near RSTA, which has the capacity of 2MLD will be able to resolve the sewerage problems.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. The Environment Division will retain Nu.12.30M from their total budget balance of Nu.24.191M, and the balance Nu.12.00M will be re-appropriated to Sewerage Section under Infrastructure Division. The budget balance is from the Landfill development works approved under SDP IV.
- b. Expenses from the appropriated budget shall be presented in every Tshogde for information to all Demkhong Tshogpas.
- c. It's reminded that all works pertaining to 11th Five Year plan shouldn't be spilled over to the 12th Five Year Plan and must be completed within the stipulated time

Action:

AFD for fund transfer and budget status presentation and all Divisions/Sections for completion of 11th FYP activities on time

Agenda 11. 4. Endorsement of Land Lease – Legal Section

Legal Officer explained on the court case between Thimphu Thromde and Bank of Bhutan (BoB) over the unauthorized construction of water caretaker's camp on BoB's vacant land. The location is near MoIC roundabout, Chubachu. The affected land measures 10,000sq.ft. and was effective from 2009.

He further explained, that as per the court verdict, BoB and Thromde are to enter into internal agreement, wherein the conditions set by BoB stands as follows:-

- Requirement of land lease from 2016, 1st March till date based on market rate i.e., Nu.5/sq.ft/year- i.e. Nu.50, 000/year.
- Agreed for acquisition of the land at a later date in the event, if required.

Some members expressed their different views on whether BoB raised their objection in the year 2009 when the camp was initially set up. Also on the requirement of carrying out feasibility study by the concerned division for acquisition of land and submit further to Management which can be further forwarded to National Land Commission.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Approved for leasing of the land as per the Internal Agreement drawn between BoB and Thromde.
- b. Feasibility studies to be carried out by Infrastructure Division and should be presented in the 12th Tshogde for finalization of the land acquisition.

Action: Legal Officer for follow ups on the case and ID to carry out feasibility studies

Agenda 11.5.Revenue Performance Audit memos for setting responsibility and timelines for action

Officiating Executive Secretary presented on the Accountability Statement which is in line with the Audit Performance report. In order to make rules and regulation more strong to safeguard the revenue, the following recommendation of RAA against the following activities were presented:

1. Thromde should maintain comprehensive registry of sources of revenue
2. Thromde should formulate strategies towards financial sustainability
3. Ministry of Finance (MoF) in coordination with Thromdes should prepare grant phase out plan
4. Thromdes should develop revenue enhancement strategy
5. Thromde should strengthen internal control
6. MoF and Thromdes should review and improve financial reporting framework
7. Thromde should strengthen expenditure control mechanisms
8. Thromde should devise strategies to encourage taxpayers to pay taxes on time
9. Thromdes should consider revision of taxes, fees and charges

10. Thromde should exercise due diligence and prudence in the management of government land
11. Thromde should institute mechanism to ensure equality and uniformity in application of taxes, charges, fees, etc.
12. Thromde should have realistic staffing plan
13. Thromde concerned should deposit the amount not accounted
14. Thromde concerned should vigorously follow-up the outstanding revenue

After prolonged discussions on the fixation of accountability for the above recommendations, the Tshogde decided as follows:

Tshogde Decision:

- a. ICT section to update the system with the help of DRD, Land Section to update the land records and likewise all other section responsible to do the same.
- b. Tshogde approved the recommended of 13th Management Meeting, regarding the issues and challenges faced by Revenue/CSD staffs as proposed by Revenue Head.
- c. Revenue Section/AFD to present the record of revenue received and expenditures incurred by revenue section to every Tshogde.
- d. Tshogde authorised the Management to decide on the fixation of accountability and responsibility based on which Section/Division the recommendations pertains to.

Action: ICT, Revenue Section/AFD for necessary actions

Agenda 6. Building inventory status conducted by ICT and DRD/Revenue status

ICT Section made the presentation on the following report compiled by Development Regulatory Division (DRD):

- Floor wise count (5436 Bldg. as of 14/6/18)
- Precinct wise count for land and building use (7254 Land/5436 Bldg. as of 14/6/18)

Chair expressed his appreciation of DRD section in successfully updating the building details with the help of the building inspectors without any incentives. The ICT Officer, Mr. Oma Pati also presented the Revenue collection received till 31st May 2018.

| SI No. | Revenue Heads | System collection | Manual collection | Major Heads Total |
|--------|---------------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| | Property taxes | | | |
| 1 | Land Tax - Commercial | 4,174,956.00 | 1,222,591.59 | 20,907,210.59 |
| 2 | Land Tax - Residential | 15,509,663.00 | | |
| 3 | Urban House Tax-Shops and Restaurants | 584,882.00 | 95,146.00 | 2,268,957.00 |
| 4 | Urban House Tax-Residential | 1,588,929.00 | | |
| 5 | Garbage Collection Charges Commercial | 2,458,316.00 | 279,732.00 | 7,257,224.00 |
| 6 | Garbage Collection Charges | 1,929,498.00 | | |
| 7 | Amenities service fee Commercial | 1,631,695.00 | | |
| 8 | Amenities service fee | 957,983.00 | | |
| 9 | Penalty-Commercial Property Tax | 179,834.00 | - | 179,834.00 |
| 10 | Penalty-Residential Property Tax | 455,778.00 | - | 455,778.00 |
| | Sub-total | 29,471,534.00 | 1,597,469.59 | 31,069,003.59 |
| | Underdevelopment taxes | | | |
| 1 | Underdevelopment Tax-Commercial | 335,023.00 | 13,493.00 | 2,836,643.00 |
| 2 | Underdevelopment Tax-Residential | 2,488,127.00 | | |
| | Sub-total | 2,823,150.00 | 13,493.00 | 2,836,643.00 |

| Water and Sewerage Charges | | | | |
|----------------------------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----------------------|
| 1 | Water Charges | 16,464,960.00 | - | 26,260,687.00 |
| 2 | Sewerage Charges | 8,236,199.00 | - | |
| 3 | Water Connection Charges-Water Line Shifting | 12,000.00 | 6,000.00 | |
| 4 | Water ReConnection Charges | 9,500.00 | - | |
| 5 | Water Connection Charges-Chamber Shifting | 223,925.00 | - | |
| 6 | Water Connection Chages-Permanent | 66,900.00 | - | |
| 7 | Water Connection Chages-Temporary | 24,000.00 | - | |
| 8 | Sewerage Connection Charges-Permanent | 66,000.00 | - | |
| 9 | Service Charges-Vacuum Tanker | 182,108.00 | - | |
| 10 | Security Deposits/Water Meter Cost | 544,840.00 | - | |
| 11 | Penalty-Water & Swerage Charge | 424,255.00 | - | |
| | Sub-total | 26,254,687.00 | 6,000.00 | 26,260,687.00 |
| | Rental Collections | | | |
| 1 | House Rent | 556,848.00 | 312,291.00 | 869,139.00 |
| 2 | Rent from Civic Amenities-Ground | 690,000.00 | 2,033,077.00 | 2,723,077.00 |
| 3 | Rental Deposits-Parking | 3,118,495.00 | 2,656,966.00 | 5,775,461.00 |
| 4 | Rent from Civic Amenities-Market | 13,796,272.00 | - | 13,796,272.00 |
| 5 | Rental Deposits-Market | 1,932,400.00 | 190,187.00 | 2,122,587.00 |
| 6 | Rent from Lease Land | 4,602,371.00 | 918,799.00 | 5,521,170.00 |

| | | | | |
|----|---------------------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 7 | Penalty-Rent from Lease Land | 32,548.00 | - | 32,548.00 |
| 8 | Penalty-Rental Deposits-Market | 42,846.00 | - | 42,846.00 |
| | Sub-total | 24,771,780.00 | 6,111,320.00 | 30,883,100.00 |
| | Land lease/CPCL | | | |
| 1 | Lease Deposits-Land Lease- Long term | 9,370,038.00 | 1,508,395.00 | 10,878,433.00 |
| 2 | Cost of excess land | - | 557,965.00 | 557,965.00 |
| 3 | Betterment charges | | 647,533.00 | |
| 4 | CPCL | - | 5,795,832.78 | 5,795,832.78 |
| 5 | Penalty-Lease Deposits-Land Lease | 1,164.00 | - | 1,164.00 |
| | Sub-total | 9,371,202.00 | 8,509,725.78 | 17,880,927.78 |
| | Documents fees | | | |
| 1 | Building plan processing fees | - | 17,270,727.84 | 17,270,727.84 |
| 2 | Site plan fee | - | 1,300.00 | 1,300.00 |
| 3 | Land transaction/registration fees | - | 382,300.00 | 382,300.00 |
| 4 | Sub-division fees | - | 58,075.95 | 58,075.95 |
| 5 | Demarcation fees | - | 301,627.00 | 301,627.00 |
| 6 | Library fees | - | 29,257.00 | 29,257.00 |
| 7 | Documents-Application(Building application) | 34,799.00 | 287,458.62 | 322,257.62 |
| 8 | Documents-Certificate(OC) | 404,415.79 | 1,300.00 | 405,715.79 |
| 9 | Environmental Clearance | - | 80,294.00 | 80,294.00 |
| 10 | Lagtharm-Fee | 172,200.00 | 67,927.25 | 240,127.25 |
| 11 | Drawing Renewal Fees | | 2,500.00 | |
| 12 | URC fees | | 163,804.00 | 163,804.00 |
| 13 | Sale Of Tender | 166,600.00 | 56,000.00 | 222,600.00 |
| | Sub-total | 778,014.79 | 18,702,571.66 | 19,480,586.45 |
| | 5% Property Transfer Tax | | | |
| 1 | 5% Property Transfer Tax | - | 77,924,857.18 | 77,924,857.18 |
| | | - | 77,924,857.18 | 77,924,857.18 |
| 1 | Fines and Penalties | - | 4,904,454.00 | 4,904,454.00 |
| | | - | 4,904,454.00 | 4,904,454.00 |
| | Total Collection as of 31st May 2018 | 93,470,367.79 | 117,769,891.21 | 211,240,259.00 |

The Total collection received as of 31st May 2018 was Nu.211.24M.

He also reported that the previous year, the total revenue collected was Nu.110M only. However, he also reported that there are some tax defaulters still which are yet to report to Thromde for payment (Institution/Organization- 51 defaulters & Individual-1276 defaulters as of 31st May 2018). Tshogde members acknowledged the support of the World Bank to digitize the land and properties within Thromde boundary which has resulted in increase if the revenue collection. The members also reminded that the defaulters should be reached through phone calls wherever possible and the remaining should be announced through print media. The progress rate should be reported to next Tshogde.

He also proposed for SMS facilities to remind the tax payers to pay their taxes and fees on time without delay. Some of the members were of the opinion that Thromde revenue should be enhanced through introduction of parking fees in extended areas such as Olakha, Changzamtok, Motithang, Langjuphakha, Taba and Dechencholing.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. ICT Section to work on the introduction of SMS facilities. Fund for it can be made from our Thromde's reserve fund of other budget is not available.
- b. Infrastructure Division (ID) to start with making as many-paid parking as possible in the recommended locations and start with tendering of parking contract from next financial year.

Action: ICT and ID

Agenda 11.6.Reconciliation statement as on 31st May 2018 was also presented.

The opening balance of the revenue on July 1, 2017 was Nu 65.00M, and the closing balance is Nu.119.00M, as per the Bank statement.

The Chair informed the members that from the beginning of the 12th Five Year Plan, Thromde will be able to meet the current expenses from the internal revenue as reported by the Department of National Budget during the budget discussion for the Fiscal Year 2018-19.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde members expressed satisfaction over the progress made on the revenue collection and recognised the lead role played by the former Executive Secretary.

Action: AFD

Agenda 11.7.Details of fund transferred from Revenue to Accounts Section was presented for endorsement

| Fund Transfer to Accounts Section | Date |
|------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| 30,000,000.00 | 25.9.2017 |
| 25,000,000.00 | 29.12.2017 |
| 25,000,000.00 | 18.01.2018 |
| 15,000,000.00 | 26.01.2018 |
| 5,000,000.00 Subject to refund to Revenue (Pre-Financing) | 16.03.2018 |
| 180,000.00 | 24.04.2018 |
| 5,000,000.00 Subject to refund to Revenue (Pre-Financing) | 25.05.2018 |
| Total fund transfer (Nu.in million) 105,180,000.00 | |

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Tshogde approved the transfer of above funds from reserve fund to the CD account operated by the Accounts Section.
- b. Henceforth, approval should be sought to utilize fund from revenue in the

subsequent Tshogde and should not be left till the end of the year for all such approvals.

Action: Accounts Section/AFD

Agenda 11.8. Security deposit for proposed construction- Submitted for Endorsement

DRD Chief presented on the proposal as detailed below;

1. Service fee of Nu.3000 as a minor scrutiny fee is proposed for processing Minor drawing approvals (Retaining walls, extension, repair works, etc.)
 - Alteration in the change of internal partitions of residential building to be levied with extra Nu.15/Sq.m and commercial Nu.25/sq.m
 - Retaining walls (below and up to 3m ht.) Nu.3000/- & more than 3m height –Nu.5000/- will be levied.
2. Scrutiny fee for all Jamthog proposed for habitable space without separate toilet and kitchen (Interconnected with lower floor) –Area of Jamthog to be included in the built up area calculation.
 - No toilet and kitchen will be allowed in Jamthog if not interconnected.
3. Scrutiny fee for ground floor commercial in UV2-MD precinct.
 - Ground floor and ground floor interconnected with first floor will be allowed to be used as commercial.- Nu.50/sq.m
 - Other floors can be used for institutional purposes also.
4. Security Deposit for proposed construction- Nu.50, 000/- is proposed as security deposit from all private individuals starting new constructions, henceforth. Any damages to the following mentioned during the course of the construction shall be rectified by the owner or else Thromde will rectify at the cost of the owner after deduction from the security deposit. Any further work balance be settled before issuance of the occupancy certificate.
 - Damage to footpaths due to heavy machines, trucks or earth moving machines.
 - Drain blocks due to construction material leading to water spillage on the roads resulting into potholes.
 - Open water pipes or water overflows from construction sites spilling onto the road.

Some member expressed that Nu.50, 000/- is too high for some common men and suggested to reduce to Nu.20, 000/-.

Whereas, some felt it's a reasonable amount since this SD is refundable if no damages are made by the building owners during their constructions, and if the SD were to be made quite low, the owners might not feel the pinch and situation might remain the same as before.

After detailed deliberations on the amount fixed for the security deposit, the following decisions were made:

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Approved Nu 3,000.00 for Minor Scrutiny fee - point 1 as proposed.
- b. Approved Scrutiny fee point 2 as proposed.
- c. Approved Scrutiny fee point 3 as proposed.
- d. Approved Nu.50, 000.00 as security deposit for any proposed building construction works with the effect from date of signing of minutes by the Chairperson. However, following conditions will have to be followed:
 - If there is no public infrastructures near the construction site, SD is not necessary.
 - SD will be collected from the building owners, prior to start of the work, with photographic evidence at the initial stage at the area where public/govt. properties is already developed.
 - Damages caused to be rectified by the building owners and in the event, if Thromde is to rectify the damages, the estimated cost amount needs to be deposited by the owner, failure to do so will delay the issuance of occupancy certificate.
 - If, available state land is leased out for stacking of construction materials, an appropriate rate which should be less than Nu.20/sq. shall be applied.

Action: DRD for necessary compliances

Agenda 11.9. Endorsement for payment of parking compensation to M/s Kuenchap Enterprise

Parking in-charge explained to the house that construction of footpath with cable duct was carried out jointly by Bhutan Power Corporation (BPC) and Thromde (66% by BPC & 34% by Thromde). Due to blockage of parking spaces at vegetable market area, parking fee collection was affected for more than two months. From the total compensation of Nu.493, 400.00 based on the parking fee tariff of Nu.10/30min/slot worked out, Thromde is liable to

pay Nu.167, 756.00 (which is 34% of total compensation).

Tshogde Decision:

The members recognizing the difficulty in working environment due to congestion, the proposed shared of Nu 167756.00 be adjusted from the next quarterly installment of M/s Kuenchap Enterprise (Parking contract outside MLCP concession area).

Action: Parking in charge for necessary follow up

Agenda 11.10. Status on Lifting of community water supply lines in extended areas to be submitted.

Chief Engineer informed that Lungtenphu community water supply lines will be removed by the end of June 2018 as agreed by the community of Lungtenphu. This was a long overdue action needed on the community pipelines, as the drains in the area are choked or there are some pipeline hanging in the area affecting the aesthetics.

Similarly, Dechencholing community lines which could not be removed during the project period will also be removed now after ensuring that municipal treated water is distributed to every plot. He also expressed huge concern over drying of some of the water sources. The water source at Karisha could not be connected to the new reservoir tank due to drying of the source; however, they will do so upon the arrival of the monsoon rain.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Tshogde members expressed full support with the works in Lungtenphu and Dechencholing as presented. The members also cautioned that the ADB water supply lines from Chamgang to Semtokha Bridge should be maintained so that the landslides do not wash away the main trunk line.
- b. In light of such risk involved, the Tshogde approved to complete removal of community water lines by end of July 2018.

Action: Water Section, ID

Agenda 11.11. Endorsement for additional budget for Meat shop

Chief Engineer explained that, initial approved budget for the proposed meat shop at the elevated car park behind Norling building was Nu.1.00M and the total estimated cost came to Nu.2.7M

The Chair further informed that the main reason to convert the lower level space at the elevated car park to meat shop is to relocate all the existing meat shops along Norzin Lam. The following advantages are most likely and will benefit the public:

- Maintain freshness of the meat supplied (With installation of air conditioner and coolers/freezers installed)
- Unloading of meat from the meat vans will be provisioned in such a way that current scene along Norzin Lam will be avoided.
- Rental charged for each meat stall will be lesser than the present meat shot spaces in the area and might bring the cost of the meat sold.
- Proper waste management will also be included in the lease agreement to be drawn between Thromde and the proprietor so that flocks of stray dogs will be avoided in the area.
- Further, BAFRA/MoEA will be requested to seek location clearance from Thromde before issuing new licenses in the Thromde boundary.

However, Chief Engineer also requested for additional fund of Nu.0.08M for installation of the air conditioners and completion of some balance works based on the quoted amount of the successful bidders. Some members also shared their views over allotting the space to the landless/needful people under Thromde to run their small businesses.

After a lengthy discussion, Tshogde decided as follows:

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Approved Nu 0.8M additional fund from reserved fund.
- b. The issues with the landless people under Thromde will be further discussed.
- c. No new meat shops will be allowed along Norzin Lam for sanctity and cleanliness.
- d. Here on, BAFRA/MoEA to seek location clearance from Thromde before issuing meat shop licenses anywhere in the City. A letter to be sent to BAFRA by the Environment Division.

Action: ID and Environment Division

Agenda 11.12. Purchase of machinery to strengthen roads and drains maintenance section

Chief Engineer submitted that road maintenance unit urgently requires an air compressor to clean the roads both for black topping and marking of the road margins, central lines and parking boxes. The purchase of Air Compressor machine (diesel engine) can highly expedite work progress and ensure quality of the work done. Therefore, he proposed an estimated amount of Nu 2.00M for from the reserve fund.

Every member recognising the fact that Thromde will mechanise some of its functions during the 12th FYP period, supported the proposal to procure the machine.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde approved for proposal to purchase one Air Compressor machine (diesel engine) at an estimated cost of Nu 2.00M for the road maintenance unit.

Action: ID

Agenda 11.13. Status of installed LED lighting within Thimphu Thromde

The Head of the Electrical Section made detailed presentation on the status of the conversion of the incandescent lamp street lighting to LED lighting within Thromde, funded through reserve fund approved by Tshogde. He also presented on the energy saving accrued through the initiative and highlighted that Thromde is saving at least an amount of Nu 200,000.00 every month on the electricity bills (copy of the details attached herewith).

The Chair then expressed concern on the switching timers not working effectively and there are always public criticism on the failures to switch ON and OFF correctly. The other members also expressed the same views and requested to change with better technology. The timers will be automatically set based on the summer and winter daylights.

Tshogde Decision:

Approval to upgrade the street light timer to satellite control timer was granted. The budget to be used from the balance approved fund for the conversion of the LED lightings. (The budget balance to be updated with ICT)

Action: Electrical Section. ID

Agenda 11.14. Endorsement for Deviation of Streetlight at various locations- Nu.2.213M

Electrical Head explained on the deviation of streetlight installation works at various locations within Thimphu and requirement for Nu.2.213M as additional budget to complete the street lighting works under 2017-18 budget.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Approved to use the balance budget, if any, from the SDP budget re-appropriated from Environment Division to ID (Refer Agenda3). After which any unmet balance to be used from Reserve Fund.
- b. Henceforth, any instruction for additional works should be carried out as per the feasibility at site and also ensure the available fund/budget is enough to cover such increase.
- c. Installation of streetlight should be prioritised properly before installation.

Action: Electrical Section, ID

Agenda 11.15. Pedestrianization of Norzin lam

Mr. Ugyen Dorji, UPD presented on the proposal to close Norzin Lam during the weekends and it can be based on phase wise closures. First phase closure is proposed along Norzin Lam 1. This area includes from Norzin Gate till main traffic, Wogzin Lam till clock tower on the south and on the north side of clock tower till BoB city branch. The proposed closure timing is also presented as from 9:00PM Friday-12:00AM Monday.

- The Norzin Lam weekend closing is to transform the street to an active, vibrant and accessible space for the community to relax and enjoy.
- Pedestrian oriented activities namely cultural, entertainment, business promotion and awareness will be welcomed.
- The activities will be operated at clock tower area and street.
- Target group: All types of age groups.

Norzin Tshogpa shared his view on allowing utility vehicles, cargo/load vehicles and ambulances to move during the closures.

However, the Chair reminded the floor that after the completion of Multi Level Car Parking (MLCP), all parking spaces along Norzin Lam will be removed. It was also discussed and agreed with the business community in presence of BCCI President that after the completion of the MLCPs, only those vehicles used for pick and drop will be allowed to pass through and will be allowed to stop not more than 15-20 minutes. The building owners also agreed that the parking along Norzin Lam can be removed after the completion of the MLCPs which is planned to be completed within December 2018.

Some raised their concern over the similar action taken by the previous Government and later had to cancel due to inconveniences faced by the general public. Many suggestions were further discussed. Followings were decided:

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Within 2018, Thromde will remove the parking areas to facilitate construction of the service ducts from Chubachu circle up to Norzin Lam gate in the Fiscal Year 2019-2020.
- b. Instead of closing whole stretch of Norzin Lam, during Thimphu Tshechu, the first phase of Norzin Lam Implementation Plan which includes closure from Norzin gate till the main traffic point will be implemented.

Action: UPD and ID

Agenda 11.16. Collection of property taxes on leased land-SLMS

The Land Management Section submitted the proposal to levy property tax on the structure built on long term leased land. Discussions followed amongst the members whether it will be fair on legal provisions are not violated to levy such taxes. Even during the 35th TLC meeting, imposing house tax on the lease land was also discussed but could not be decided. Finally the Legal Officer was asked to provide the legal basis on whether such taxes will be applicable. The Legal Officer stated that during the execution of such lease agreement, the conditions state that any property built on the leased land will be built as per Thromde's regulation; however, there is no mention of realization of property tax from such properties. Unlike the taxes on freehold land and structures built thereon, the land lease rate is based on the land use and much higher than the tax on freehold land and property.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde did not consider the property tax collection on leased land since the rate applied is already based on the land use type unlike normal land tax while leasing out.

Action: SLMS

Agenda 11.17. Endorsement for Precinct change proposal for Changzamtog LAP

Based on the appeal received from the residents of Changzamtog LAP, the Urban Planning Division proposed to change the precinct for more number of floors. The members after deliberations understood that the precinct has been changed by the consultant during the preparation of the LAP. The Urban Planning Division confirmed that the precinct has changed during LAP preparation and Tshogde could reverse back as appealed by the residents.

Tshogde Decision:

The approval to change the precincts was considered in line with the provisions of the Thimphu Structure Plan (TSP).

Action: UPD

Agenda 18. DCR for undersized plots

The Development Regulatory Division in consultation with the Urban Planning Division came up with the following DCR for the undersized plots on the instructions from the National Land Commission. Enough time was observed to deliberate on the understanding of all members on the need of such DCR to resolve all the pending plot development.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. 1 to 2.99 Dec- land to be acquired or can be joined with neighbouring land
- b. 3 to 6.99 Dec- 3 storey- open basement+2fl- setback 1.5m – basement to be used for parking (Green channel)
- c. 7 to 9 Dec- Follow DCR 2016
- d. CPLC to be adopted without physical land pooling for the above land/plot sizes

Action: UPD

Agenda 11.19. Endorsement for Purchase of 2 numbers RTK equipment for Survey and Land Management Section (SLMS)

The SLMS submitted the need to procure 2 additional numbers of RTK equipment to help expedite survey and demarcation of plots within Thromde. They also highlighted the need to calibrate the existing total stations which incurs costs while being dispatched to India for calibration. Besides the cost, the efficiency to survey and demarcate plot using total station is not as much compared to RTK. The benefit of such equipment was clearly discussed and every member was made to understand the importance of having RTK. Based on this, the house decided to consider the request.

Tshogde Decision:

Approved to purchase the 2 numbers RTK equipment from budget balance

Action: SLMS

Agenda 11.20. Purchase of Utility Vehicles for AFD & ENV Divisions

AFD stressed their requirement of pool vehicles in attending to official works since they were forced to use the Taxis and other means of transportation on their staff's own expenses.

Proposal is put up to purchase the ISUZU vehicle (Utility car) which cost around 1.10M and dispose off the bolero under Environment Division which is presently used by AFD. This Bolero remains most of the time off road. Similarly vehicle requirement is also proposed under Environment Division.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Approval is endorsed for purchase of 2 Nos. ISUZU vehicle (AFD/ENV- each)
- b. Import license approval should be sought from the appropriate agencies before purchasing the vehicles.

Action: AFD

Agenda 11.21. Endorsement for Refund requested by Sonam Peldon- Nu80, 000.00

Environment Division Chief explained that Mrs Sonam Peldon has made the payment against the rental of clock tower. However due to some other events, the rental was cancelled by Thromde. Thromde now requires refunding the amount back to her.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde approved to refund Nu.80, 000.00 back to Mrs Sonam Peldon.

Action: ENV Division

Agenda 11.22. Citizenship Identity Card Mandatory for Party goers

Mr Yeshe Wangdi, the Head of the Environment Division submitted that during the weekend night inspections carried out in the City by Thrompon on many occasions youth under the age of 18 were found in the entertainment centres. The proprietor of such centres were warned to keep away minors as per the rules but without making them produce CID compulsory, the checking of their ages were not possible at the entrance. The members deliberated at length on the proposal arguing on the convenience of carrying such important document under the influence of alcohol. Weighing all the reasons, the house decided to make the CID compulsory for the youths coming for entertainment. The bouncer/proprietor will be required to check the CID if the boy/girl looks young for such places for entertainment. The visiting team on the weekends can also ask for CID if they feel that they are minor.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde approved the proposal to make mandatory for young party goers to carry CID or else they should not be allowed to enter. Thromde will issue notification in media to create awareness on the enforcement of the rule to curb minor visiting the entertainment places.

Action: ENV Division and other related divisions/sections

Agenda 11.23. Authorizing Care Bhutan to monitor on behalf of Thromde

The Head, Environment Division reported to the floor that as discussed in the 13th Management meeting, the youths taking care of Centenary Park (Care Bhutan) will be issued with an authorizing card for monitoring the behaviour of the public visiting the park.

Proposal also included introduction of nominal fees for the party organisers within the park area such as birthday celebrations and wedding anniversaries at Nu.3000.00 Nu.5000.00 respectively.

Tshogde Decision:

1. Tshogde approved to issue an authorization card for monitoring the area on behalf of Thromde.
2. Tshogde approved collection of user fees/charges for Coronation Park.
3. Tshogde also approved the user fees for different purposes to be different (Birthdays- around Nu.3000.00- & Marriages – around Nu.5000.00). The Environment Division to work out the rate and apply accordingly.

Action: ENV Division

Agenda 11.24. Proposal to Shift Ash disposal site from Hejo to two locations downstream

The increase in referral cases to Jigme Dorji Wangchuck National Referral Hospital from across the country and increase in the resident population has resulted in more number of deaths, increasing the number of dead bodies cremated at Hejo cremation ground on a daily basis excepting the Sundays. This has proportionately increased the volume of ashes disposed in the river upstream of Lingkana Palace. The members strongly supported the proposal to shift the disposal site considering the volume of pollution happening on a daily basis. The Planners suggested the two possible locations downstream.

However, some members raised their concerns over the longer distances from cremation ground and the ash disposal sites. Those people without vehicle will face problems of transporting the ashes to the disposal site.

After exchanging many views and discussions at length, the following decision was made.

Tshogde Decision

Tshogde approved to shift the ash disposal site from Hejo cremation ground. A team led by Environment Division to carry out location feasibility study and present back in in the next Tshogde for endorsement.

Action: ENV Division

Agenda 11.25. Up-gradation of Taba School to MSS

Taba –Dechencholing Tshogpa informed the floor that presently the Taba School has classes from Pre Primary to 8th standard. He expressed the concern over the proposal of Thromde Education Office to convert Taba School to full-fledged primary school level, their reason being that as per the School classification Taba School with its highest classes up to 8th standard does not fall under their standard names. However, as per the area Tshogpa, since Dechencholing School already is over crowded with large number students, Taba School needs to be kept as it is or could be up-graded to class 10th standard, whichever is possible.

Education Section is asked to explain to the members on maintaining the same School Classification based on the MoE's classification system, whether it applies same for Dzongkhags and Thromdes. After the explanation by TEO, the Tshogde decided as follows:

Tshogde Decision:

1. The Taba School shall function same as before.
2. 12th FYP activities to be presented by Thromde Education Office to the next meeting.
Any changes required will be further discussed during this presentation.

Action: TEO

Agenda 11.26. Water leakage below building at CFM- Norzin Tshogpa

Complaint received from public is raised by Norzin Thuemi on the blockage of drains running below CFM. Chief Engineer, ID explained that due to level differences of the drain outlet and the inlet, backflow of the drain water was observed at the site. A joint site visit is proposed.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. A joint site visit led by ID, area Tshogpa and the concerned public to be carried out in solving the drain issues.
- b. Norzin Tshogpa is also to render assistance in recovering Nu.45, 360/- from those people who have used the parking area in 2014 for the construction purposes behind NN Tshongkhang. This is in order to resolve the Audit memos under Zone Building Inspector's name.

Action: ID and Norzin Thuemi

Norzin Tshogpa also raised the requisition made by Taxi Tshogpas requesting for increasing the existing taxi parking area at Lungtenzampa.

Chairperson explained that discussion over increasing the taxi parking was already held during the previous site visits made with the traffic stakeholders and Taxi Tshogpas. The wall below bridge towards plantation side will be excavated and levelled for their usage which can be done departmentally.

Similar request from Motithang Tshogpa was also discussed.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. ID to take up the extension of existing taxi parking area near the traffic office at the earliest as identified before.
- b. Taxi parking area requirement at Motithang will be looked into later when road markings are being carried out at that area.

Action: ID and concerned Thuemis for necessary follow ups

Agenda 11.27. Formation of Local Association/Medey Tshogpa Association-Babesa Tshogpa

Babesa Tshogpa explained that this proposal came from Medey Tshogpas. Meday Tshogpa seems disheartened since there is no acknowledgement of their roles. With the formation of this Local Association, which is internationally recognised, they are expecting that they will have more acknowledgements nationally.

Legal officer's view was sought on the above matters and following decisions were arrived at:.

Tshogde Decision:

- a. Formation of Local Association by Medey Tshogpa cannot be approved by the Tshogde.
- b. Improving and strengthening the present Medey Tshogpa to be looked into in line with provisions of Local Government Act.
- c. Demkhong Tshogpas will be responsible for forming or creating their own community based Medey Tshogpas as deem fit.

Action: Respective Thuemis

Agenda 11.28. Delay in Contract works

Grievances were shared by Jungshina-Pamtsho and Taba-Dechencholing Thuemis regarding the contractor for development of infrastructures in the two demkhongs not able to perform as expected. They also expressed their concerns over Thromde not able to fix accountability when concerned site engineer had resigned from the job or changes their post of duties. Similar concerns were also expressed by other members of the house and the Chair requested the Chief Engineer, Infrastructure Division to rigorously follow up with the contractors and ensure successful completion within the stipulated timeframe without compromising on the quality of works.

Tshogde Decisions

The Tshogde instructed the Infrastructure Division to ensure timely completion of the works in all Demkhongs without compromising on the quality. Tshogde also mentioned that the tender committee should look at awarding works only to the bidders with workable rates and not necessarily to the lowest.

Action: ID

Agenda 11.29. Covering of Manholes by the blacktopping

Babesa Tshogpa expressed concern on the covering of manhole by the blacktopping works which makes it difficult to locate the manhole in the event of a blockage or release of new service connection to the manhole. He requested the Thromde management to see if there is better technique to overcome such practical difficulties. The members gave different options as solutions such as covering the manhole cover during blacktopping and marking the location for future references or the manhole cover to be raised to the height of road surface as usual.

Tshogde Decision:

Henceforth, the work for raising the manhole cover will be awarded to the same contractor who has been awarded the blacktopping works.

Action-ID

Agenda 11.30. Updates on waste Management

Mr. Yeshey Wangdi, Head Environment Division Chief presented on the updates made in the Waste Management. He also submitted the comparison of the expenditures incurred related to waste management during the year 2013 and as of now. He also showed the latest updates made through social Media and connecting in different ways with the public. The public have easy access to waste management information through whatever apps or social network they feel comfortable to use such as Gmail, WeChat, Facebook, Whats-app, etc.

Agenda 11.31. Any Other Points

11.31.1. Funding for Football team of Thimphu Thromde playing in the Departmental tournament -Nu.50, 000.00

The Thromde football team member submitted the request of fund support of Nu 50,000.00 to the house to participate in the departmental football tournament. Many of the members showed support for such participation mainly to encourage and motivate the Thromde staffs to participate and perform as a team.

Tshogde Decision:

Tshogde approved to fund Nu.50000.00 for the football team to participate in the departmental tournament to encourage Thromde staffs to perform better and improve service delivery.

Action: Accounts Section/AFD

Rapporteurs – Ugyen Lhamo and Kunlay Yangdon, Engineers, ID Division